

## REMARKS

This Amendment is submitted in response to the outstanding Office Action dated September 10, 2004, wherein the Examiner again rejected claims 1-11 and 17-33, all the claims pending in the application. Reconsideration of the application in view of the amendments made herein and the following remarks is respectfully requested.

These rejections are respectfully traversed.

The principal reference relied upon by the Examiner in this Office Action is the Visalli patent, which is directed to a horse pacifier design. As described in Visalli, the device includes a series of elastomer rubber pieces that rotate along a shaft. These elastomer rubber pieces are defined as rubber wheels 1, 2 which are rotatable about the longitudinal axis of shaft 3 as the horse attempts to chew the rubber wheels. Each of the rubber wheels is formed with a plurality of ribs 7 along the periphery thereof in order to provide a textured surface therealong.

The Visalli device, while arguably including two members (the rubber wheels) independently rotatable with surfaces formed with a plurality of scrubbing elements (ribs 7), fails to teach having substantially planar surfaces which carry the scrubbing elements, which are perpendicular to the axis of rotation, and which completely face each other. Rather, as shown in Figs. 1 and 2 of the Visalli patent, surfaces 8 of rubber wheels 1 and 2 effectively define the tread of wheels 1 and 2, are arcuate or curved in shape, as well as being coaxial with and/or circumferential with respect to the axis of rotation (of the wheels) as defined by shaft 3; moreover, the surfaces (in their entirety) do not face each other. This is precisely not what is described and claimed in the subject application, in which the first surface of the first rotating member and the first surface of the second rotating member face each other, are in general, substantially flat and are also perpendicular to and cut across the axis of rotation. This, in turn, provides for the scrubbing elements mounted along the surfaces of each member to be disposed

in a far more advantageous position/orientation than what is found in the Visalli teaching.

Accordingly, and in view of the amendments made herein, Applicant submits that claims 1-11, 13-16 and 18-35 are directed to allowable subject matter. Early and favorable action is requested.

<p><b><u>CERTIFICATE OF MAILING UNDER 37</u></b> <b><u>CFR §1.8</u></b></p> <p>I hereby certify that this correspondence is being deposited with the United States Postal Service via First Class mail service in a post-paid envelope addressed to: Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450 on 9/30/04.</p> <p><i>Hannah Epstein</i> Hannah Epstein</p>
---

Respectfully submitted,  
**GOTTLIEB, RACKMAN & REISMAN, P.C.**  
Attorneys for Applicant(s)  
270 Madison Avenue, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10016  
(212) 684-3900

Jeffrey M. Kaden  
Reg. No. 31,268

Dated: New York, New York  
September 30, 2004

S:\Hannah\FORMS\Amendment.SecondHartz037.wpd